50 Years of Scottish Transport Campaigns

from Beeching to High Speed Rail

Price £4.50

ISSN 2047-6469





The Scottish Association for Public Transport 1962 – 2012 Text and design by John McCormick Historical Research by Tom Hart

- The Beeching Years of Decline
- Rail Resurgence across Scotland from Highlands to Borders
- Buses and Deregulation
- Ferries
- Tourism and Transport
- High Speed Rail
- The Last 50 Years and the next?

Introduction

The renaissance of Scottish railways has been remarkable, with 25% passenger growth in the last 5 years. Re-opening of the Larkhall, Alloa and Airdrie-Bathgate lines is to be followed by the Borders Rail Link and Edinburgh-Glasgow electrification.

This contrasts with the gloomy outlook fifty years ago. The Beeching axe hung over much of the rail network. The Waverley, Stranraer, Far North and Kyle lines were threatened with closure. Rural branches to Aberfeldy, Ballachulish, Crieff and Dornoch disappeared from the rail map. And major stations like Glasgow St.Enoch, Edinburgh Princes Street and Dundee West closed.

The story of the campaign for better transport over the last fifty years is outlined in the following pages. The Scottish Railway Development Association was founded in 1962 to oppose rail closures and push for better train services. A nationwide transport system needs bus/rail co-ordination and so the SRDA became the Scottish Association for Public Transport in 1970.

Political and public opinion has now swung very much against rail closures. However, local bus travel is declining, and Transport Scotland's Rail 2014 consultation highlights the cost of maintaining the ScotRail network. The Scottish ferry network is also facing a shake-up as a result of EU competition rules and the Scottish Government's ferry consultation exercise.

So what will the next 50 years hold for Scottish transport?

If HS2-S goes ahead this will be the first new trunk rail route in Scotland since the Aviemore-Inverness direct line was completed via Slochd in 1898. HS2 will also need new terminal capacity in Edinburgh and Glasgow. This will be an opportunity to reconfigure local suburban railway routes into a higher service frequency Metro Light Rail network.

Rising oil prices and pressure to reduce CO_2 emissions will increase the uptake of electric or hybrid cars and continue the trend towards more rail travel. Railfreight is also increasing.

Bus deregulation in 1983 has not been an unqualified success. A new framework is needed now for bus services, moving away from the focus on competition law towards recognition of the passenger benefits of high quality, integrated public transport networks.

So there is much to be done in the next 50 years!

Tom Hast Vice President SAPT John McCormick Chairman SAPT *Chrís Harvíe* President SAPT

June 2012



Tom Hart, John McCormick, and Chris Harvie after the SAPT AGM in May 2011.

ISSN 2047-6469



Scottish Association for Public Transport

Contents

Section		Page
1	Foreword by Malcolm Reed	4
2	The SAPT at Fifty by Chris Harvie	5
3	The Beeching Years in Scotland	6
4	Organising Transport	10
5	The Highlands and North-east	14
6	Edinburgh, Lothians and Borders	16
7	Central Scotland and Fife	20
8	Tayside	21
9	South West Scotland	21
10	Glasgow and Strathclyde	22
11	Buses and Deregulation	26
12	Ferries	28
13	Tourism and Transport	30
14	High Speed Rail	32
15	SAPT Office Bearers 1962-2012	35
16	The last 50 years – and the next?	36
	Photos by John McCormick unless otherwise attributed	

1 Foreword by Dr.Malcolm Reed CBE

SAPT Secretary 1972-1974 Director General Strathclyde PTE 1997-2005 Chief Executive Transport Scotland 2005-2009



When Terry Gourvish approached me to ask if I would be prepared to consider letting my name go forward to succeed him in 1972 as Secretary of the then Scottish Railway Development Association, I had little idea what I was getting into! I was of course aware of the Association's work, and the campaigning that was still needed to defend railways north of the Border, but when I became more actively involved I quickly realised that this was an organisation of some substance. It was ably led by Canon Barkway and Tom Hart, together with a committee of able and informed members and a President, Sir James Farquharson, of international stature in the railway profession, who regarded his role as much more than simply honorific and added valuable insights both to the Association's consideration of policy issues and in its dealings with government.

This was also a time of real change in Scotland: the 1968 Transport Act was being implemented; detailed analysis was taking place of the performance of west central Scotland's economy and of its future transport network; and local government reorganisation was looming. At the same time, however, it was also clear that – despite the first stirrings of a wider environmental awareness – more road building was still generally seen as the panacea that would deliver Scotland's economic future, whether in tackling the problems of remoter rural areas or in promoting regeneration in the central belt. Public transport was still regarded by too many politicians and senior officials as largely irrelevant to their vision for a modern Scotland.

It was against this background that members approved the decision to change the organisation's title in 1972 to SAPT, reflecting in its new name the importance of promoting an integrated approach to public transport and the need for an effective voice to speak out in the interests of Scottish public transport as a whole, not simply on behalf of its current users and supporters, but to ensure that the then car and lorry based orthodoxy was challenged within Scotland's strategic decision-making processes. An early and gratifying response to this change of name was an approach by the Scottish Bus Group to become a corporate member, something which was completely unexpected. With the credibility the Association already drew from its local authority and other corporate members, and the good informal cooperation we enjoyed from the Scottish Region of BR and other transport providers, we found that doors were being opened at senior levels in the Scottish Office, and that our arguments were beginning to carry more weight. In addition to engaging with other related organisations that were seeking to promote a more sustainable approach to public policy in Scotland, we were invited to the meetings that initiated the Transport 2000 campaign across the whole of the UK, and our President's input to the Montefiore commission's report also ensured that SAPT's views reached a much wider audience furth of Scotland.

Changes in my own career made it necessary for me to step down from the SAPT committee after a couple of years, but I have always regarded it as a real privilege to have been involved at this key time, and to have participated in the Association's activities when so much around us was changing. It was therefore very gratifying to be asked by John McCormick to contribute a foreword to this publication, and the fact that the following chapters record how hard SAPT has had to continue to campaign since the 1970s demonstrates that the Association still has a vital role to play. In retrospect, it is enormously disappointing that the incoming Government in 1997 failed to respond to the tide of public opinion that brought it to power and did not deliver on the promises in both its UK and Scottish transport white papers – opportunities for change on that scale are perhaps only offered once in a generation.

One of our visiting speakers remarked at a SAPT meeting 40 years ago that Scotland was a country where transport integration ought to be able to work. The fact that it doesn't yet do so shows that there is still a need for SAPT's voice to be heard. I wish the organisation every success for its next 50 years.

Malcolm Reed CBE

The SAPT at Fifty

by Professor Chris Harvie, SAPT President

'Ist es so weit?' the Germans say. That time already ... 50 years since a few of us, from across the spectrum, tried to stop an act of cultural as well as economic destruction. In the 1960s I ran – a learning curve, not a triumph – the East Scottish branch of the Scottish Railway Development Association, while Tom Hart was then and has been since the real ideas man, vindicated by results. Terry Gourvish, also active, would record in his great study of nationalised *British Railways* how railway 'modernisation' (aka. disinvestment) was consensual, signed off by the *Guardian* as well as the *Express*.

In an urban society, Beeching was less drastic than Louis Armand of the SNCF who closed the 'tortillard' departmental lines which many saw as the spirit of France. To many Beeching's axe wasn't sharp enough. Frank Cousins preferred the buses and lorries his TGWU members drove; Tony Crosland told Peter Parker he wanted 'a nice *little* railway'. So too did the 1993 privatisers, only to be throttled by their overdriven 'internal market', and the steady efforts of our ever-argumentative members. At last, their efforts are bearing fruit.

In Scotland there was also the problem of manufacture. The death of the N.B. Loco, followed by the 'offshoring' that North Sea oil implied, wounded engineering, our Detroit. Then the car-driven 'supermarket revolution' clubbed our small towns, the training-ground of apprentices and SMEs. Living since 1980 in provincial Germany taught me lots of lessons, only tardily picked up by UK politicians: the captive under-25 market as a basis for local rail/bus integrated investment and ticketing, open stations, and on-the-spot fines (on companies as well as fare-dodgers) latterly double-deck trains and dual-voltage tram-trains. By contrast, even in the noughties, Scottish views on transport were still dominated by motoring and motorists, despite the approach of Peak Oil.

Scotland still undervalues the engineering and technical skills needed to develop modern public transport. No one came out of the Edinburgh tram *imbroglio* with any credit, save the Basque engineers at CAF who produced the cars on cost and on schedule. Tramways must be extended, but despite SAPT's efforts little was known about their revolutionising Europe's regional transport.

The best we can expect? With two of the UK's largest players – Stagecoach and First Group – housed here, we ought to have led in integration. Instead we get *some* integration where Company X controls the system – otherwise competition of an often primitive sort where it doesn't. The programme of Transport Scotland (vague enough) remains that of early-2006, before financial crash and fuel inflation hit; and a lazy PR-culture continues to favour the car, despite a life-expectancy shortening by the month.

For inappropriate market and competition paradigms to be discarded, we will need a rebalancing. Transport Scotland must become research-driven and pro-active. Major European state or regional rail systems – one or more – must be its allies in a ten-year programme of restoring an autonomous, integrated system, training up a workforce, funding experiment, and creating firms that are once more capable of competing internationally, particularly at the critical softwarehardware interface. 'Top Gear' was described by its chief perpetrator as 'a bit of fluff': well said, Jeremy Clarkson. The natural partner for renewable energy is public transport and at its core will be the train. The next decade, kicking off with the return of Borders Rail, has to be the SAPT's best.

Chris Harvie

SAPT President Chris Harvie, an MSP from 2007 to 2011, is an author of several books including "The Rise of Regional Europe", "The Floating Commonwealth", and "Deep Fried Hillman Imp".

He became Professor of British and Irish Studies at the University of Tubingen in 1979, and received the Officer's Cross of the Order of Merit of the German Federal Republic on 12 March 2012 for services to education and cultural co-operation in Germany, Scotland and the British Isles.

3 The Beeching Years in Scotland

Blue Trains and Beeching Axe

The 1960s were a decade of mixed fortunes for Scottish railways. On the one hand, the British Railways Modernisation Plan brought the new electric "Blue Trains" to the North and South Clyde networks. Main rail services from Glasgow to Edinburgh and Ayr were operated by new "intercity" diesel multiple units introduced from 1957, and branch lines were also dieselised.



Poster advertising the inaugural "Blue Train" service from Airdrie to Helensburgh (1960)

But, in London, the conservative Transport Minister Ernest Marples was intent on making the rail network profitable. The Transport Act 1962 created the British Railways Board, replacing the British Transport Commission (BTC) which had been established in 1948 to develop an integrated transport system for Britain (something still awaited 64 years later!)

Dr. Richard Beeching was appointed Chairman of the BTC in 1961, and published his "Reshaping of British Railways" in March 1963. The effect on the Scottish Region was devastating (see map on opposite page).

All rural railways, apart from the West Highland line, were to close. No railways would have existed north or west from Inverness, or to south-west Scotland and the Borders. The West Highland Line was to be spared in recognition of the poor condition of the parallel A82 road, and the largely single-track A830 Mallaig road.



Map of closures proposed by the Beeching report published in 1963. There would have been no railways north or west from Inverness, or in south-west Scotland.

Opposition to Rail Closures:

Scottish Railway Development Association

The 1962 Transport Act laid out closure procedures including the requirement for the Transport Users Consultative Committee to hold hearings where closure would cause significant hardship. Most of the closure proposals were opposed by local action groups. But the Minister of Transport was not obliged to accept TUCC recommendations.

The need for a national organisation to oppose rail closures in Scotland led to a meeting in Stirling in 1962 to form the **Scottish Railway Development Association**. The SRDA focus was to oppose substantial rail closures in Scotland, and to press for development and modernisation of the railways as an alternative to increasing reliance on roads. Canon Oswald Barkway, of the Scottish Episcopal Church, was appointed chairman. Tom Hart, a law student at Glasgow University, became secretary. Other early members included Chris Harvie, Frank Spaven, Ken Sutherland, Frank Neville, and Jack and Helen Broadbent. The knowledge that the Beeching Report was being prepared led to growing SRDA membership, including local authorities.

The argument for greater investment in trunk and suburban rail routes was made in an SRDA paper, **"Scottish Railways – the next five years**", issued in June 1964. This advocated:

- Glasgow-Gourock electrification
- Fast regular interval trains on trunk routes
- More suburban trains to Glasgow St.Enoch
- Free parking at all stations

The campaign to save rural lines

The first Beeching closure opposed by the SRDA was the Crieff-Gleneagles line. Canon Barkway presented the SRDA case at the TUCC hearing. But British Railways argued that revenue on lines served by diesel railbuses failed to meet costs, even allowing for the income contributed to the trunk network. The line closed in 1964.



LOST: Crieff-Gleneagles, closed in July 1964. *Photo: Frank Spaven*

The lines north and west of Inverness were more fortunate, due a very active Macpuff campaign, helped by Frank Spaven who was an early recruit to the SRDA in 1962. As a member of the Scottish Development Department in Edinburgh, and from 1966 head of planning at the Highlands and Islands Board, Frank played a crucial role in saving much of the Highland rail network, including the Far North and Kyle lines. Frank's logical and analytical approach was decisive in changing the approach towards railways within the Scottish Office. Frank continued as a very active Vice President of the Scottish Association for Public Transport until his death in 2003 at 85.



SAVED: Kyle of Lochalsh-Inverness *Bus connections via the Skye bridge now replace the ferry link to Kyleakin. Photo: Colin Miller*

Elsewhere, campaigns had less success. Vociferous local opposition to the Waverley route closure included the local MP, David Steel. SRDA suggested that, instead of closure, the Waverley route could be saved by introducing regular interval diesel multiple units between Hawick and Edinburgh.

Some intriguing Waverley route issues have been rediscovered in recent research by David Spaven, son of Frank. Knowing that plans were extend electrification being made to northwards from Crewe to Scotland, SRDA proposed study of electrifying the Waverley route from Carlisle to Edinburgh, and the Nithsdale route via Dumfries to Glasgow. This would have served a larger population than the Beattock route, which could be closed. This unorthodox approach apparently received more consideration than was realised at the time, as the Scottish Office was keen to avoid closing the Waverley line. However, retention of the Waverley line was over-ruled by Richard Marsh, the Labour Government's Minister of Transport, and the line closed in January 1969.

The Stranraer-Ayr line was reprieved, partly because of its strategic ferry link to Northern Ireland. Closure of the Dumfries-Stranraer line was partly ameliorated by diverting some trains from London and Newcastle via Kilmarnock and Ayr to Stranraer. But these have been withdrawn. Transfer of Stena ferries from Stranraer Harbour to Cairnryan in 2011 has lost some of the remaining passenger traffic on the Ayr-Stranraer line, with rail/ferry passengers now carried by bus from Ayr station to Cairnryan.



SAVED: Stranraer Harbour-Ayr But ferry passengers to Ireland now have a bus link from Ayr station to Cairnryan.

City Cuts - Glasgow

Stations in Scottish cities and suburban lines also felt the effects of the Beeching Axe. Glasgow's St.Enoch and Buchanan Street stations closed in 1966, with services transferred to Central and Queen Street.



Glasgow St. Enoch Photo: Colin Miller

St. Enoch (above) was demolished and is now a shopping centre. Train services to Ayrshire (below), Stranraer, Kilmacolm and Dumfries were diverted to Glasgow Central. A short new connecting line at Shields Junction allowed Paisley Canal trains also to reach Central.

SRDA recommended to British Railways in 1963 that the Paisley Canal line would carry many more passengers if a regular half-hourly diesel service was introduced. The Paisley Canal line escaped the Beeching axe, but was closed twenty years later in 1983 along with the Kilmacolm line. Paisley Canal eventually got a half-hourly service after re-opening in 1990!



A diesel "inter-city" unit leaves Glasgow St.Enoch for Ayr in 1966. Photo: Colin Miller

SRDA members Jack and Helen Broadbent formed a local group, the East Kilbride Railway Development Association. This was very active in promoting the East Kilbride line, and led the successful campaign to avert closure. In Glasgow, one of the major casualties of the Beeching axe was the Glasgow Central Low Level line from Rutherglen to Possil and Dumbarton, despite its obvious potential as a strategic cross-city network.



Diesel unit about to leave Possil for Rutherglen shortly before closure in 1964. Photo: Colin Miller

Edinburgh, Aberdeen and Dundee lost most suburban stations. Major termini at Princes Street and Dundee West also were closed.



Edinburgh's Princes Street terminus closed in September 1965. Photo: Frank Spaven

Often forgotten was a second round of closures not recommended by the Beeching report. These followed from completion of the Forth and Tay Road Bridges and the decline of the coal industry in Fife. These left Alloa without rail services to Stirling, Dunfermline and Larbert. The branches to Tayport, St.Andrews, Leven and Grangemouth were also closed.

A final 1970 post-Beeching closure in this area was the direct line from Dunfermline via Kinross to Perth. Dr.Terry Gourvish, then SRDA Secretary, appeared at the pre-closure hearing and argued that this route was being sacrificed to release space for the new M90, which was subsequently built through the sites of the former stations at Kinross and Glenfarg.

Organising Transport SAPT, Regional Councils, ScotRail, and Devolution

Scottish Association for Public Transport

By the late 1960s, the majority of rail closures lay in the past. Most SRDA members felt that developing an integrated public transport system, rather than focusing only on the rail network, was the best way to counter excessive trunk road spending.

The **Scottish Association for Public Transport** was proposed as the new name at the 1972 SRDA AGM by SRDA Secretary Dr.Malcolm Reed (who later became Director General of SPT, and Chief Executive of Transport Scotland), Dr. Terry Gourvish (now Director of Business History at the LSE, and author of many transport books including the Official History of the Channel Tunnel), and Tom Hart. All three were at the time in the Department of Economic History at Glasgow University.

Some SRDA members preferred to focus only on rail issues and joined the Railway Development Society.

Regional Councils

4

The two-tier Regional/ District Council structure introduced in 1974/5 brought a significant change to transport organisation. Regional Councils were given responsibility for transport and land use planning and were required to prepare Transport Policies and Programmes (TPPs).

The Middle East War in 1973 led to a sharp rise in oil prices which also raised questions about the relative costs of road and rail transport. SAPT took this opportunity to raise the profile of public transport in Council spending, arguing that the Scottish Office should take the lead in setting national priorities for Regional Council TPPs.

A series of SAPT study papers, including *The Finance and Organisation of Transport* (1972) argued for a fairer basis for funding road and rail. New roads, such as the dualled A74 over Beattock, the M8, M9 and M90 were used below design capacity.

Political Developments

Scotland voted by a narrow margin for a Scottish Assembly in a 1979 referendum, but it was not enough under the terms of the 1978 Scotland Act to activate an Assembly. A Scottish Parliament was off the agenda for 20 years, but SAPT argued for extending devolution of road administration (introduced in the 1950s) to incorporate rail. The Scottish rail network had the advantage of being within a unified British Railways Scottish Region since 1947. But the fact that this was mainly under Ministry of Transport control was an obstacle to developing comparative road/rail appraisal in Scotland.

The new generation of Scottish Office and local government planners did strive to address this issue but in the 1970s politicians were more influenced by the apparent advantages of spending on roads at a time when Scotland had an above average share of UK public spending. This was despite Scotland having lower levels of car ownership – or possibly because of this, there was a greater political aspiration to accelerate car ownership and use! Where the prospect of more rail closures arose, there was sufficient political disquiet to ensure that the electorate was not antagonised by a return to closures.

Prior to 1976, there had been an implicit threat of more closures in the second Beeching Report of 1965 identifying a limited number of "Routes Selected for Development". But Dr Beeching soon retired from BR and was elevated to the House of Lords!

A further serious threat came with the 1983 **Serpell Report on Rail Finances.** Serpell was a career civil servant who outlined a range of options for the Thatcher government (see map opposite). His most extreme option left Scotland with one route north from Carlisle, dividing for Glasgow and Edinburgh.

Some other lines around these cities would have survived but the popular uproar led the UK Conservative government into immediate backpedalling. But it was easier to end closure threats (for what was seen as a social railway with few benefits for the economy) than to introduce a forward-looking rail strategy.

Scottish Office Ministers such as George Younger and Malcolm Rifkind were sympathetic to rail (George Younger was SAPT Vice President for a time), and supported a balanced approach to transport. Malcolm Rifkind addressed the 1982 SAPT AGM.



The 1983 Serpell Report suggested a range of draconian options that would have destroyed large parts of the rail network in an attempt to achieve profitability. "Option A" would have closed the East Coast Main Line between Edinburgh and Newcastle and left no railways north of Edinburgh and Glasgow.

"Option C2", shown above, was the result of a superficial analysis of traffic flows which would have terminated the West Highland Line in the village of Crianlarich, while the Aberdeen-Inverness line would have stopped midway between the two cities!

The Launch of ScotRail

A pivotal development in Scotland's railway organisation was the launch of the ScotRail brand by Chris Green in 1984. This established the concept of ScotRail as a more independent network than the previous Scottish Region of British Railways.

Innovations started under Chris Green's 20 months at ScotRail included initial design of the radio signalling system now in use on the West Highland, Kyle and Far North lines, the Strathclyde Manning agreement that allowed driver/conductor crewing of electric suburban trains, and the introduction of regular interval timetables on Scottish inter-city routes.

SAPT had several meetings with ScotRail during this period, including discussions about the Dornoch Rail Bridge which developed into an application for Parliamentary Powers for its construction (see next section).

The ScotRail brand has lasted through privatisation and devolution to emerge as "Scotland's Railway".

Unitary Local Authorities

Problems for transport organisation and funding arose from the abolition of Regional Councils by the Conservative Government in 1993 and the return to a larger number of unitary local authorities. Fortunately, this did not lead to the abolition of SPT – seen as a vital regional body in an area where travel-to-work often crosses local council boundaries. New arrangements were made for regional economic and land use planning to continue across areas larger than local councils.

Devolution

After the Scottish Parliament was established in 1999, SAPT welcomed the opportunity for direct contact with the **Scottish Government** and with the **Committees of the Scottish Parliament**. Funding for buses and rail franchising was devolved to Scotland.

Transform Scotland

In 1996 the SAPT Committee agreed to back an umbrella group for organisations campaigning for sustainable development in Scotland. **Transform Scotland** was created in 1997, chaired by David Spaven. SAPT is a member. But relationships with the privatised **Railtrack** remained difficult. The creation of the shortlived Strategic Rail Authority (SRA) and continued DfT involvement added complexity. There was some improvement after the UK government in 2002 replaced the SRA and Railtrack with **Network Rail** (NR). NR, unlike the Scottish Government, has borrowing powers. A Scottish Division was set up in 2011.

The **McNulty Report on Rail Delivery** identified opportunities for cutting operational and infrastructure costs. Rail governance became an issue with concern that complex relationships were increasing costs and reducing incentives for improvement.

Transport Scotland is responsible for overall road, rail, bus and ferry financing. However, there is concern that, despite strong growth in rail use, and ambitious targets for reducing emissions of CO₂, roads are again being given an unhealthy share of the transport budget, as expressed in the excerpt from *The Scotsman* (opposite).

Regional Transport Partnerships

SAPT welcomed the concept of **Regional Transport Partnerships** (RTPs) set up in 2006. But these have insufficient powers and funding. SPT has greater funding than other RTPs, but has lost rail powers and has no direct involvement in land-use planning. **Transport Scotland** is over-centralised but lacks powers in some critical areas of co-ordination and development.

To achieve an integrated public transport network that can respond to local development strategies, RTPs should be given greater funding and freedom to innovate, by transferring some responsibilities and transport funding from Transport Scotland.

Effective co-ordination of bus and rail services will depend on simplifying the procedure for RTPs to establish statutory Local Bus Quality Partnerships and Quality Contracts, and to influence the provision of local train services.

If this can be achieved it could improve public transport delivery at lower total cost. Control of overall rail strategy would remain with Transport Scotland.



Analysis: Despite the trend, it's roads not rail that still get the money

By TOM HART Published on **Monday 12 March 2012 00:00**

THE data showing rail trips at their highest since the 1920s confirms a rise in rail's share of travel which was evident both before and after the recession. Unlike car and bus use, rail trips are showing upward trends in both Scotland and England.

Network Rail has conservative forecasts of further 30-60 per cent growth in the coming decade. The Independent Committee on Climate Change expects car traffic to remain stable or show a fall.

The combination of static incomes, bargain off-peak or advance fares and rising car fuel and insurance costs has undoubtedly influenced rail growth, possibly more so in Scotland, where there is less road congestion than south of the Border.

These trends fit well with the economic and low-carbon policies of the Scottish Government, yet there is a risk of rail growth being held back by a shortage of trains and the use of higher fares to cut overcrowding.

Infrastructure investment is still dominated by major road schemes (the new Forth crossing being the largest), with road – not rail – gaining extra funding in the Scottish Budget. Programmes for Central Belt rail electrification are slipping, as are orders for trains. Extra rail investment to tackle track and station pinch-points is urgent.

• Tom Hart is vice-president of the Scottish Association for Public Transport.

The Scotsman, 12th March 2012.

The Highlands

In the early 1970s the Highlands and Islands Development Board (HIDB) had an active role on transport developments in the Highlands. SAPT welcomed an HIDB proposal to study electrification of the Perth-Inverness line. Russell Johnston, MP for Inverness, became SAPT Vice President and pointed out that, though there was a case for A9 improvement, the capital costs for the massive roadworks had to be compared with the lower costs of rail improvements. Instead of electrification, it was decided to restore double track on the recently singled Blair Atholl to Dalwhinnie line.

"The Far North Line: A Plan for the Future" was prepared by Frank Spaven and Adrian Varwell and issued by SAPT in 1972. This outlined options including a direct rail link from Tain to Golspie via the Dornoch Bridge – a debate which continues into the 21st century. The study led to a BR initiative to counter the adverse impact on rail of the new Kessock and Cromarty road bridges and the planned Dornoch Bridge. BR applied in 1985 for parliamentary powers for a direct Tain-Golspie railway with an integrated road/rail bridge over the Dornoch Firth (see opposite page). The town of Dornoch was less than enthusiastic about this scheme.

By 1986, the Scottish Office was cooling to the scheme. Hopes were finally dashed by Michael Ancram, Scottish Office Environment Minister, in 1987, amidst press accusations of deception.

However, SAPT was involved in successful campaigns to re-open Alness (1973) and Muir of Ord (1976) stations between Inverness and Tain.

Highland Rail Partnership (HRP), formed after a 1995 conference for rail interests organised by the Friends of the Far North Line, achieved a major expansion of services around Inverness.

From three services daily in the 1980s, *Invernet* now provides eight daily trains from Tain to Inverness, with four of these starting from Wick. More Inverness-Edinburgh/Glasgow trains have also been introduced, with the promise of a full hourly service. HRP is now part of the HITRANS Regional Transport Partnership.

The North-East

North-east Scotland arguably suffered the most extensive rail closures with the loss of the complete rail network around Aberdeen other than the main Aberdeen-Dundee and Aberdeen-inverness lines. SAPT has had less involvement here due to fewer active members in the area.

But the SAPT campaign for a regular interval rail timetable throughout Scotland focuses the need to upgrade the Aberdeen-Inverness line to allow an hourly frequency on this inter-city link. Plans have been discussed since the 1980s for additional loops and track upgrades to enable this service. Network Rail is now carrying out a study of the engineering potential to deliver an hourly service, with possible new stations at Kintore and Dalcross (for Inverness Airport).

The Aberdeen Crossrail concept supported by the North East Transport Partnership (NESTRANS) envisages an additional halfhourly local train service from Stonehaven to Inverurie, with new stations at Kintore, Aberdeen Airport, Aberdeen North (in the Bucksburn area), and Newtonhill.

Given the poor state of the A96 Aberdeen-Inverness road, and economic growth around Aberdeen and Inverness, an upgrade of the railway should be top priority. Unfortunately, a return to an increasingly roads-dominated agenda is favouring the Aberdeen Western Peripheral road for early expenditure.

New or re-opened stat	tions Highlands& NE
Alness	1973
Muir of Ord	1976
Dyce	1984
Portlethen	1985
Dunrobin Castle	1985
Loch Eil Outward Bour	nd 1985
Loch Awe	1985
Falls of Cruachan	1988
Beauly	2002
Laurencekirk	2009

5



ScotRail 1985 Staff Bulletin advancing the case for the Dornoch Rail Bridge. This initiative was subsequently rejected by Michael Ancram, Scottish Office Environment Minister.

Edinburgh, Lothians & Borders

Edinburgh Metro

6

As early as January 1967, the Scottish Railway Development Association had published a paper on Edinburgh Rail Rapid Transit. This suggested developing two rapid transit routes from Corstorphine to Musselburgh, and Curriehill to Leith Central, sharing the central section from Haymarket through Waverley to Abbeyhill. This called for 25kV ac electrification, additional through platforms at Waverley, and escalators at Waverley steps (now achieved 45 years later – this was a long term view!). The map in this proposal is shown below.

Edinburgh City Council and the Edinburgh Transport and Amenity Association (in which Prof Arnold Hendry, former SAPT President, was involved) both opposed major urban road proposals, favouring instead a mix of rail, light rail, bus and pedestrianisation schemes.

In 1973 SAPT published a study paper on the options for Edinburgh, now favouring an initial west-east tram route from the Airport to the city centre, with subsequent branches to south-east Edinburgh and Granton/Leith.

The new Lothian Region issued a consultancy report on Light Rail Transit in 1979. This was negative on the advantages of light rail over buses, and was criticised in a joint SAPT/ Light Rail Transit Association response in early 1980.

Growing congestion led to revival of plans for a major Western Approach Road to the city centre, in addition to the relief road already built on the former railway to Princes Street station.

Former SAPT President Arnold Hendry put forward a plan for a Metro network, with priority for a north/south line in tunnel under Waverley. An Edinburgh Metro conference in autumn 1986 attracted 250 people. However, environmental pressure to put more of the metro in tunnel raised questions over the project's funding.

Edinburgh City Councillor David Begg was at this time also becoming a leading advocate of better public transport, parking controls and road demand management.



Edinburgh Rail Rapid Transit proposed by the SRDA in January 1967

Rail Renaissance

Despite no progress with Light Rail/Metro ideas in the 1980s, ScotRail and Lothian Region opened a number of stations in this decade, followed later by Wallyford, Brunstane, Newcraighall and Edinburgh Park.

The re-opening of the Edinburgh-Bathgate line in 1986 was the first significant reversal of the gloomy outlook of the Beeching era.

By 2010, the four new stations on the Bathgate line had a total of 1.8 million passengers annually. Train service frequency was doubled to half-hourly. Now, with the Airdrie-Bathgate re-opening (see next section), trains run every 15 minutes and passenger traffic is continuing on an upward spiral.

The Capital Rail Action Group (CRAG) was formed in 1989 to promote re-opening of the Edinburgh South Suburban Railway (ESSR). After evaluation, Edinburgh City Council decided not to support this initiative. SAPT believes the future for the ESSR could now depend on Tram Trains linking into the Edinburgh Tram at Haymarket to reach Princes



Left: SAPT excursion train at Bathgate in 1985.

This was the first Edinburgh-Bathgate passenger train for many years, and was arranged by ScotRail, several months before reopening of the line to the public.

The line closed to regular passenger trains in 1956, but was retained for freight.



SAPT supports integrated public transport, and this includes good rail and bus links to principal airports, allowing international travel to link seamlessly with the Scottish rail network.

When a new runway and terminal at Edinburgh Airport were considered in the late 1960s, Francis Richardson, a planner with Livingston New Town Development Corporation and member of SAPT Committee, argued for the new terminal to be located alongside the Edinburgh-Fife railway, with a new curve to link to the Edinburgh-Glasgow line. This suggestion was rejected at the public inquiry.

The Edinburgh Airport Rail Link (EARL) planned by the Scottish Government in the early 2000s was therefore welcomed. The enabling Act was passed by the Scottish Government on 14th March 2007 and received Royal Assent on 19th April. Tie (Transport Initiatives Edinburgh) was given control of the project.

But former SAPT President Prof Arnold Hendry had serious reservations about EARL project costs. During development of the project, the design of EARL was changed to create two separate rail routes from Haymarket to Edinburgh Airport to provide extra capacity, but this further increased cost and complexity. In subsequent meetings with tie, SAPT queried the logic of simultaneously providing rail and tram access to Edinburgh Airport, when the cost of each was clearly rising.

As controversy over the cost of EARL increased, SAPT suggested scrapping the airport line, and instead providing a tram link from a new West Edinburgh interchange station at Gogar on the Edinburgh-Fife line. This solution was adopted by the new SNP Government in July 2007, with the EARL project suspended indefinitely.

But this "Edinburgh Gateway" station at Gogar is now delayed until nearer the expected tram route completion in 2014.

Edinburgh Tram

Road congestion in Edinburgh led to a Joint Authorities Transport and Environmental Study (JATES) being commissioned in 1990. The Scottish Office subsequently published its "Setting Forth" strategy, based on a second Forth road bridge and upgraded roads. Edinburgh Council decided on a guided busway (City of Edinburgh Rapid Transit, CERT) to improve public transport in west Edinburgh.

In 2002, the Council decided that a tramway was their preferred solution for the west Edinburgh transport corridor. CERT was abandoned and Transport Initiatives Edinburgh (tie) was given responsibility for delivering the tram network. This soon faced problems.

SAPT joined forces with *Transform Scotland* and other groups to campaign against the SNP Government's wish to abandon the scheme. Other tram schemes, including Manchester and Dublin, have proved very popular. Finance Secretary, John Swinney, stepped in to ensure extension of the route through Princes St to St Andrew Square but with no extra money from central funds and no certainty about extension over the busy corridor to Leith and Newhaven.



Edinburgh Tram on Princes Street, 2011

Extension of the tram system, involving further disruptive street works, is at the moment unlikely to be politically acceptable. This will leave the city with one truncated line and an under-used fleet of trams. However, growing interest in operating trams on underused railways could open up a new possibility. A new route from Haymarket to the south side of the city via Morningside to Cameron Toll could be created, using the Edinburgh South Suburban Railway. A short extension on-street would link to the Edinburgh Royal Hospital.



Setting Forth in the Wrong Direction

Following publication of the Scottish Office "Setting Forth" strategy in 1992, SAPT joined with the Cockburn Association and the newly formed *Forthright Alliance* to oppose the plan for a second Forth road bridge. SAPT suggested instead a policy of improving train and bus services between Fife and Edinburgh, with differential road tolls to encourage car drivers to avoid peak hour travel where possible.

The plans for a second Forth road bridge were dropped in 1997 but, though rail and bus use across the Forth began to rise, while car use stabilised, further modal shift was hampered by lack of rail rolling stock, and delays to bus services caused by road congestion.

After discovery of corrosion on bridge cables, plans for an additional road bridge were revived in 2007. These again met strong opposition. Removal of tolls means the estimated £1.6 billion cost of the second road bridge will monopolise transport capital spending for several years, affecting rail, active travel and other lesser road schemes throughout Scotland. Despite this, all the major parties in the Scottish Parliament voted for the Forth Crossing Bill in 2011. The new bridge is due to open in 2016.

Borders

The Borders were particularly badly affected by Beeching rail closures, with all the area's railways shut.

Pressure to re-open the Waverley route has continued. The Campaign for Borders Rail was formed in 1999 and has contributed to the success in obtaining approval for re-opening of the line from Edinburgh to Tweedbank.

The project will be delivered by Network Rail, with a predicted opening date of 2014 and a budget of £295 million. Extension to Hawick and Carlisle is being mooted.



The Campaign for Borders Rail map of the project to restore passenger trains to Galashiels and Tweedbank (www.campaignforbordersrail.org)

Alloa

In 1987, SAPT initiated a campaign to restart passenger trains on the Alloa-Stirling line (see "Alloa Advertiser" right). At that time, the line was still in use for freight from Stirling as far as Cambus, though passenger trains had been withdrawn in 1968. SAPT's suggestion for extending Glasgow-Stirling trains to Alloa received no support from Central Region, though Clackmannan District was enthusiastic

A local STAR (Stirling-Alloa Rail Re-opening) campaign continued, and won backing from Stirling Council and local MSP Keith Brown.

The rebuilding of the line was entrusted to "tie" (Transport Initiatives Edinburgh). The project had to be rescued by Network Rail and after remedial engineering works, reopened in May 2008 from Stirling through Alloa to Kincardine, where the line joins the Edinburgh-Dunfermline-Kincardine line.

Alloa station is used by 400,000 passengers per year, far above the 155,000 target.

Airdrie-Bathgate Re-opening

In the 1990s, Railfuture members Ralph Barker and Tony Lennon produced a report advocating restoring a diesel shuttle service on the Airdrie-Bathgate line.

The Central Scotland Transport Corridor Studies in 2003 recommended re-opening of the Airdrie-Bathgate line as a double track electric route, with a 15-minute train service, as part of a package of initiatives to improve travel along trunk routes in the Central Belt. SAPT Vice President Tom Hart served on the Steering Committee of the CSTCS.

Leven: the Methil Special

Levenmouth (including Leven and Methil) has a population of over 30,000. The highlight of the SAPT 1992 AGM was the "Methil Special" (see right) organised by ScotRail. Track from Thornton to Methil still exists, but not in use, so restoring rail services should be possible.

Right: Front cover of programme for the SAPT AGM on the "Methil Special". This train, organised by ScotRail, was the first to call at Glenrothes with Thornton station, and ran from Kirkcaldy to Methil via the Fife Circle.

Alloa rail link plea

A £1 MILLION plan to reopen according to SAPT, would ina rail service between Alloa volve an initial capital injec-and Glasgow / Edinburgh has tion of £250,000 from Central been submitted to ScotRail and region and a similar amount McKenzie.

Central Regional Council by from the Scottish Development the Scottish Association for Department. The remaining Public Transport, writes Eric 2500,000 would come from the EEC. In its submission, SAPT The association wants both bodies to conduct an urgent claims Alloa is one of Scot-

feasibility study of its plan, line, closed in 1968, before the of the Bathgate rail link which track is destroyed.

Caldercruix

land's largest towns without a involving the reintroduction of rail service, and point to the a six-mile Stirling-Alloa branch success of the recent reopening in its first year achieved a 66 per cent higher passenger-use Funding of the project, than had been targeted.

Above: Alloa Advertiser 31st July 1987 At that time, the Stirling-Alloa line was still in use for freight as far as Cambus, and could have re-opened to passengers relatively easily.

Re-opened stat	ions in Fife and Central Scotland
Bridge of Allan	1985
Glenrothes	1992
Dalgety Bay	1998
Dunfermline	
Q. Margaret	2000
Alloa	2008
Armadale	2011
Blackridge	2011

2011



Tayside

Tayside is unusual in having no new railway stations opened since 1980, despite efforts by the late Frank Neville, a prominent SRDA and SAPT member in the 1960s and 1970s.

Prospects for new stations have been weakened by a slower pace of housing development near railways than in other areas, and by reluctance by Transport Scotland and ScotRail to introduce extra stops which would extend journey time between the Central Belt and Aberdeen. Some remaining stations between Dundee and Arbroath have been reduced to a minimal service, though Broughty Ferry has an enhanced service on an experimental basis from December 2011.

One important development which took place after closure of the direct Edinburgh-Perth route via Kinross was the acceptance of a SAPT suggestion to reopen the Ladybank-Perth line to passenger trains. This line now has an hourly frequency, as an integral part of the Edinburgh –Kirkcaldy- Perth-Inverness service. Dundee and Perth have both seen innovations in local bus services and publicity, but also illustrate problems of bus/rail co-ordination. SAPT welcomed the Beeching concentration of Dundee train services on one station, close to the city centre and local bus routes. It was hoped that this would be followed by relocation of the bus station to a site beside the rail station, but ScotRail objected on the basis that this would increase the temptation for rail users to switch to using coach services!

In Perth, there is an opportunity to rationalise the over-large railway station site to allow better integration with local bus services.

The Tay Estuary Rail Study, sponsored by TACTRAN, recommends an hourly Arbroath-Dundee-Perth-Glasgow regional train service that would provide greater accessibility to the rail network for passengers from Arbroath, Broughty Ferry, Carnoustie, Dundee, Gleneagles and Dunblane. A co-ordinated bus service could connect from Auchterarder and Blackford into this regional rail service, as a prelude to reopening Blackford station.

9

8

South West Scotland

Dumfries train services would have been adversely affected by Beeching proposals to close the direct Glasgow-Kilmarnock line via Barrhead, and divert trains to the longer route via Paisley and Dalry to Kilmarnock. Objections to this closure from SRDA and other organisations were successful, though the Dalry-Kilmarnock line was closed instead.

SAPT was directly involved in the successful campaign to re-open Sanquhar station, which had closed in 1965 along with the other intermediate stations (except Kirkconnel) between Kilmarnock and Dumfries.

Re-opened stations in South West ScotlandGretna Green1993Sanquhar1994

The Ayr-Stranraer Harbour line maintained a fairly frequent service of seven trains per day until transfer of the Stena Irish ferries to the new terminal at Cairnryan in 2011. Loss of rail/ferry passengers (who now have a bus link from Ayr station to Cairnryan) is expected to cut use of Stranraer station by half.

The future of the Stranraer line depends on developing a new role for the railway. In this rural area, most local bus services are subsidised, so there is an opportunity to coordinate bus and train timetables to attract more local users. SAPT's Tourism and Transport strategy (see Section 13) could boost tourists to Galloway. Access to trains from Stranraer town also needs to be improved by a direct pedestrian link to the Harbour station, or by building a new station.

The Inglis Report and Beeching

The Inglis Report of 1951, produced for the British Transport Commission, recommended extensive electrification of Glasgow's suburban rail network (see map on next page), and the rundown of the Glasgow Corporation Tramway system. Electrification of the North Clyde lines through Queen Street went ahead in 1960, and Neilston and Motherwell lines via Cathcart Circle in 1962.

But other proposals were overtaken by the Beeching cutbacks. Some routes recommended for electrification by Inglis were instead closed, including lines to Renfrew Fulbar Street, Hamilton via Shettleston, and the Central Low Level network to Dumbarton, Possil via Kirklee, Rutherglen, and Newton via Tollcross.

Clyderail

10

Glasgow was more fortunate than Edinburgh as the Greater Glasgow Transportation Study (GGTS) was completed in 1967 to inform debate. This report recommended rail upgrades and major motorway schemes for the Greater Glasgow area.

In 1974 SAPT published "A Better Glasgow: Transport and Environment" jointly with five other bodies including New Glasgow Society. Faced with the massive motorway programme for the Glasgow area, SAPT argued for a shift from road schemes to investment in rail and bus, including making use of the extensive Central Low Level railway network through the city which had closed in 1964 but had been recommended for reopening in the GGTS.

The Greater Glasgow Passenger Transport Executive (which became Strathclyde PTE) developed a ClydeRail scheme, with one of the main proposals being re-opening of the Rutherglen-Partick section of the Central Low Level network, with a new junction at Partick linking to the Queen Sreet-Helensburgh line.

This received Government approval, and was reopened as the Argyle line in 1979 by SPTE.

However, decisions were deferred on other Clyderail proposals, including the St.Enoch Bridge link to High Street and Bellgrove, and a link from Bridgeton to High Street which would have allowed some trains from Lanarkshire to be routed via the Queen Street Low Level line.

The new Strathclyde Regional Council, formed in 1975, slashed the rash of major road schemes which had emerged from the GGTS, including the Maryhill and Lomond Motorways and the east-west motorway through Queens Park. But the M8 across Glasgow was given top priority.

Glasgow Metro

While SAPT welcomed the Argyle Line, there was disappointment that many of the disused rail alignments through Glasgow (including the Kirklee line) and the St.Enoch Bridge line were not developed. Much of the Central Low Level network (other than the Argyle line) has now been lost due to residential developments.

SAPT continued earlier campaigns for frequency improvements to quarter-hourly on most short distance routes, using higher capacity, lightweight Metro trains.

Towards a Glasgow Metro, published by SAPT in 1986, proposed expanded Metro services and additional stations on the Queen Street Low Level lines, with extensions to the south via the St.Enoch Bridge, and expansion on the Argyle line.

Manchester's endorsement in 1983 of a light rail approach, including heavy rail conversion and some new construction, was seen as a way of making greater use of the extensive rail network in Glasgow.

A major SAPT *Light Rail Conference* was held in Glasgow on 28th November 1987. Speakers included J M Ossewaarde, Director of Amsterdam City Transport, and David Scotney, of Lothian Region's transport team. SAPT's campaign continues in 2012.



Map of Railways in Glasgow and District proposed for development in1951, including possible new North Station

Strathclyde Rail Plan

Strathclyde PTE published a new **Public Transport Strategy for the 21st Century** in 1989. In addition to the Paisley Canal line, reopened in July 1990 with 6 new stations, the strategy included a number of rail proposals:

- Glasgow Central-Whifflet line
- Queen Street High Level to Maryhill
- Glasgow CrossRail (see below)
- Rail electrification to Cumbernauld and East Kilbride (new Town Centre station)

The Whifflet and Maryhill proposals went ahead. In 2005 the Larkhall line, and stations at Kelvindale, and at Greenfaulds, Stepps and Gartcosh on the Cumbernauld line opened.



Strathclyde Tram

Following SAPT's Light Rail conference, the SPT strategy also proposed **Strathclyde Tram**, with the first route to run from Drumchapel to Easterhouse via the city centre (see opposite).

An extensive consultation was carried out into the tram proposals. SAPT welcomed the concept, but the SAPT committee who spent considerable time on the issues felt that the route duplicated the Queen Street Low Level line for a significant proportion of its length. The proposed route also used on-street running instead of disused rail tunnels in the west end of Glasgow, increasing the risk of encountering road traffic congestion.

After much detailed design and consultation work, the Strathclyde Tram was finally rejected by Parliamentary Commissioners. The reasoning behind this was never made public. But funding for the Strathclyde Tram would have been problematical, particularly given the recent experience with the Edinburgh Tram.



Clyde Fastlink

For the Clyde Waterfront development west from the city centre, initial discussions involving SAPT and other organisations led to proposals in 2003 for light rail on the south bank of the Clyde, reached via the bridge proposed at Finnieston. But the waterfront was being developed faster than a feasible timescale for light rail funding and completion. So although the "Squinty Bridge" was designed to support trams, the decision was taken to adopt a bus-based rapid transit solution, possibly using specialised buses like First Group's "ftr" future tram-style buses (below).



The initial "Clyde Fastlink" route from Glasgow city centre via the SECC to the Southern General Hospital will consist of a mixture of reserved roadway and public streets. The Scottish Government has now allocated £40 M funding for the project, with the first phase expected to open in 2014. "Clyde Fastlink" could be extended to Braehead and Renfrew.

Clyde Metro

SAPT's response to Transport Scotland's consultation on ScotRail 2014 refranchising reiterated the case for co-ordinating public transport in the Glasgow area.

Urban rail services within around 15 miles of should be specified Glasgow in full consultation with SPT with the objective of developing a strategy for a more appropriate, integrated metropolitan transport fully network incorporating urban rail, bus and subway services and an ITSO version of the Oystercard smartcard ticketing system. Urban metro or tram/train should be explored on some lines as a longer term possibility.

Providing lightweight electric trains without toilets and with high density seating for "Metro" urban journeys within around 15 miles of Glasgow could cut the capital cost per seat, operating costs, and track access charges for these services. Re-organising rail services in Strathclyde into "Metro" and Regional services could allow lightweight Metro trains (perhaps 2-car high voltage trains of similar capacity to Newcastle Metro trains) to be procured at relatively low cost. "Metro" and heavier Juniper trains are contrasted below:

Train	Capacity	Weight	
Metro	68 seats/232 stan	iding	39 tonnes
Juniper	183 seats		125 tonnes

A map of possible *ClydeMetro* routes is below.



Deregulation and Privatisation

The Thatcher Government's privatisation and deregulation of buses in 1986, following the 1985 Transport Act, removed the rigid control exercised by the Traffic Commissioners and reduced public subsidy for the bus industry.

But SAPT were concerned about the possible implications of the sell-off of the mainly publicly owned bus sector In Scotland. The initial sales were of the centrally owned **Scottish Bus Group** subsidiaries but this was soon followed by the former Corporation Transport Departments in Glasgow, Dundee and Aberdeen. Edinburgh survived as a publicly owned body but renamed **Lothian Buses** to reflect minority holdings by other councils in Lothian Region.

First Group (the former Aberdeen Corporation bus company) and **Stagecoach** have emerged as transport companies on the world stage.

SAPT forecast that deregulated competition would bring too many buses into city centres, contraction of other local services (especially in evenings), old poorer quality buses, and collapse of efforts to improve interchanges and through ticketing.

Competition Commission

Attempts to organise stable bus services have been complicated by competition laws which, rigidly applied, seem to work against bus users.

The Competition Commission report on the bus industry focuses on fostering competition in commercial services. This encourages frequent timetable changes and duplication of services as operators jockey for market domination which, once achieved, leads to a monopoly. The rapid 6% annual decline in bus use in Scotland suggests this policy has failed.

Quality Partnerships

Developing high quality priority bus corridors, and frequent cross-city rail services, with bus/ rail integration in suburbs and rural areas, is the approach taken in many countries.

In the UK, Quality Partnerships where the local council invests in bus priority and information improvements can encourage bus operators to provide higher quality services.

However, the procedure for setting up Quality Contracts, giving the local authority power to fully specify a high quality bus service, has proved too complex for widespread adoption.



A particular problem is the number of buses in city centre streets, as in Glasgow's Renfield St. (left). This increases pollution and congestion, affects the city centre pedestrian environment, and reduces bus punctuality.

Quality Contracts, giving city councils control over city centre bus services, could create a more orderly operation.

11

Bus Funding Crisis

SAPT published *A Brighter Future for Buses* in 1993 calling for a measure of re-regulation but government proved unreceptive. In the 1990s there was some increase in local council support for non-commercial services while scheduled bus operators benefited from Bus Fuel Duty Rebate. Most operators had shortterm horizons rather than seeking to influence ways in which parking charges, land use planning and urban regeneration schemes could be modified to encourage bus use.

Throughout rural Scotland, local bus services became more dependent on council support. Some 75% of services in Dumfries and Galloway were soon dependent on council funding in addition to the support given to school bus travel. Shared travel by taxi became more popular for taking shopping home from supermarkets and other out-of-town retail outlets. This saw the beginnings of debate on how to better organise rural (and evening) access to give better value within limited budgets for those without easy access to cars.

In 2012 freezing of government funding for the concessionary bus scheme, and reduction in the Bus Service Operator Grant (BSOG), while fuel costs are rising and bus ridership is falling, has created a crisis for the bus industry.



Swiss Integration

Swiss public transport connects every town and village by a network of connecting buses and trains, as above, where a Swiss Postbus waits outside a station to <u>connect with the train</u>.

Through fares are available between any two places on the national transport network, and connections are reliable and well used.

A New Approach

Threatened withdrawal of services which have become uneconomic is putting pressure on councils to fund more loss-making bus routes.

Scottish Government support for bus services through the concessionary scheme and BSOG amounts to around £250 million. Some of this supports long distance coach operations which in many cases duplicate train services, also heavily subsidised by taxpayers. Using scarce public money to fund competition is a luxury that can no longer be afforded. Funding should be targeted at socially necessary services.

A new approach should channel bus funding through local councils and regional transport partnerships to maintain a network of bus routes that are essential to provide access for local communities. Quality Partnerships or Contracts should specify co-ordination of bus timetables with train and ferry timetables to create a national public transport network linking all villages, towns and cities in Scotland.

This new regional bus fund could be resourced by scrapping BSOG and modifying the old age concessionary scheme to start at state pension age, with validity restricted in urban areas to off-peak services, and with a charge levied for longer distance coach journeys.



Scottish Disintegration

Citylink and Megabus <u>compete with trains</u> for passengers, as at Aviemore station (above).

Many local bus services are being cut for lack of funding, while taxpayers fund competition between coaches and trains through the Bus Service Operator Grant, Concessionary Travel Scheme, and Scotrail franchise payments.

Ferries

Roll-on/Roll-off Revolution

In the early days of SRDA in the 1960s, Scottish ferry services were provided by the Caledonian Steam Packet Company, P&O and MacBraynes and were fully integrated with rail and buses.

The Scottish Transport Group, formed in 1969 from the Scottish Bus Group, was given responsibility for Clyde and Western Isles ferries and started the evolution to roll-on/rolloff ships. Vehicle traffic grew quickly, while demand for passenger cruises declined.

SAPT defended the importance of maintaining ferry connections for "classic" passengers, and for developing leisure and tourism trips. The SAPT paper **Loch Lomondside: Transport and the Environment**, March 1974, was a response to Countryside Commission concerns that a planned new road on the west side of Loch Lomond could be very disruptive of the environment and the leisure experience. The radical SAPT solution was a new railway direct from Balloch to Tarbert to be used by lorry and caravan 'ferry trains' as far as Crianlarich linked with road tolls on the west side of the loch and a combination of public transport and parking charges to reduce car use.

Smaller passenger ferries were proposed for an extended season on Loch Lomond, plus frequent passenger ferries on the short links from Inveruglas to Inversnaid and Inverbeg to Rowardennan. The Loch Lomond & Trossachs National Park has facilitated new ferry services on Loch Lomond 35 years later!

SAPT Memo 76/2 **Clyde Ferries and Cruising**, August 1976, provided ideas for the next stage of modernising the Clyde ferry fleet. On grounds of cost and changing public preference towards foreign holidays rather than 'doon the watter' trips, the memo accepted that demand for 'large ship' cruising on the Clyde was falling but suggested a new "Clydelink" service pattern linking resorts while still providing vehicle ferry services. But no other champion was found for these ideas.

Franchising

The 1980s and 1990s saw steady improvement in service levels and quality of ships on Scottish ferry routes. Tourism to the islands has been stimulated by good marketing in the "Explore" and Northlink brochures.

However, the cost of supporting Caledonian Macbrayne and Northlink ferries is giving the Scottish Government concern, with an annual ferry budget of around £110 million. The road equivalent tariff policy is increasing this.

The Ferry Review started by the Government in 2010, and the more detailed 2011 Draft Plan for Consultation, contains proposals which could potentially increase costs by specifying more frequent sailings to Arran, Mull, Tiree, Colonsay and Barra. A more economic and much shorter route to South Uist from Mallaig is rejected in the draft plan, in favour of continuing the existing sailings from Oban.

EU regulation of state subsidised services requires Scottish ferry services to be tendered. This raises the issue of "unbundling" of routes, which could split up the ferry network into individual routes, with private operators able to bid for potentially profitable routes, leaving taxpayers to fund the intrinsically loss-making all-year sailings to islands with low population like Colonsay (population around 100).

Unbundling also would reduce the flexibility to redeploy ferries from elsewhere in the network in the event of breakdowns, risking islanders being stranded for lengthy periods.

Tourism will also be adversely affected if the quality of ships is reduced, and comprehensive marketing of the Clyde, Western and Northern Isles contained in the CalMac and Northlink brochures is replaced by individual operators responsible for each route.

The Government is to publish a Final Ferries Plan by the end of 2012. Unless these concerns are addressed, ferry franchising could rival rail privatisation as a very costly exercise.

New Ferry Routes

Some changes to the current ferry operations will be needed if the aspirations of ferry users are to be met. In the response to the ferry draft plan, SAPT suggested reconfiguring some routes to give the more remote islands extra sailings at an economic cost.

Colonsay, which in winter is served three times per week from Oban, could receive extra calls by extending some Kennacraig-Islay sailings (see map). A South Uist-Mallaig service would cut sailing time to 3 hours 45 minutes (compared with 7 hours via Barra to Oban).

A new international link to Norway could be trialled in summer by altering the Aberdeen-Shetland ferry timetable to provide an Aberdeen-Lerwick-Bergen sailing once weekly.

A full revision of ferry timetables could deliver these benefits while seeking to improve connections with trains and buses. Attracting more ferry users to continue their journeys by train or bus would save the cost of transporting their cars, and help to reduce CO₂ emissions.

Delivering these tangible benefits to islanders and visitors deserve higher government priority than issues of unbundling and privatisation.



Reconfiguring ferry routes could improve sailing frequencies and reduce costs. The South Uist-Mallaig crossing takes 3 hours 45 minutes compared with 7 hours via Barra to Oban.



Above: CalMac ferries "Clansman", "Isle of Mull", and "Lord of the Isles" sail to Mull, Coll, Tiree, Colonsay, Barra and South Uist from Oban.

With an integrated fleet covering the Western Isles, ferries can be diverted to cover for breakdowns, major delays and overhaul periods. "Unbundling" routes to be operated by separate private operators would increase the risk of stranding passengers for long periods when sailings are disrupted.

Tourism and Transport

Tourism in Scotland

13

Tourism is worth over £4 billion to Scotland, and employs more than any other industry. VisitScotland statistics show that while many come by car, an increasing proportion of visitors arrive by public transport. Green Tourism is a product that Scotland can market.

Train, bus and ferry operators have long recognised the importance of optional travel to keep rural routes going. Observation cars were provided on the Mallaig and Kyle lines.



1961 leaflet distributed on the West Highland Line observation car to Mallaig.

Macbraynes ferry *Columba* (now the *Hebridean Princess*) offered Minicruises in the 1970s as part of the scheduled sailing programme to Tiree and Colonsay. Scottish ferry journeys are attractive Scottish tourism assets.

But ScotRail franchising has now shifted rail emphasis to the service quality regime (SQUIRE), with no focus on tourism initiatives.

Tourism and Transport

In 2010 SAPT launched a "Tourism and Trains" campaign jointly with Friends of the West Highland Lines. The objective is to raise the profile of Scotland's scenic railway lines, building on accolades like Wanderlust magazine readers who voted the West Highland line as the world's top rail journey. With the help of Loch Lomond and Trossachs National Park Authority, a meeting was arranged with Tourism Minister Jim Mather for December 6th 2010 at the Park HQ in Balloch. Presentations were prepared highlighting the progress in other countries in promoting tourism using public transport.

However, the worst blizzard for many years hit Scotland on December 6th, blocking roads in Central Scotland (including the M8) so the only attendees were those who came by train.

Further meetings were held at Holyrood, in Glasgow for Fergus Ewing (Tourism Minister since 2011), and in Balloch in March 2012 for Transport Minister Keith Brown.

The aim is to convince Transport Scotland to give priority to developing train services on Scotland's scenic lines (West Highland, Kyle, Far North and Stranraer), not only as lifeline transport links to remote areas, but as world class assets for the Scottish tourist industry. Posters have been produced for West Highland stations (see opposite).

Coach tours, and circular tours linked with ferry or train trips, are opportunities to further develop tourism and generate revenue. The Loch Lomond "Bus and Bike" service (seen below at Luss) is a recent tourism initiative.





Above: Poster designed by Norman McNab of the Friends of the West Highland Lines for station billboards, and displayed in 2012 in Glasgow Queen Street, Haymarket, and some WHL stations.



Green tourism by train is a growing opportunity for promoting Scotland and rail travel. The picture above was taken at Spean Bridge on the West Highland Line.

French Railways SNCF started the first TGV European high speed trains in 1984, after the success of the Japanese Bullet Trains. Extensions of the French high-speed (TGV) network and the start of building of the Channel Tunnel prompted SAPT publication of *Eurorail North* in 1988, proposing an Anglo-Scottish High Speed Line, but this was somewhat ahead of its time.

In Britain, the situation differed in that main InterCity lines were better aligned, and were being progressively upgraded to 125 mph from the 1970s. BR committed to the Advanced Passenger Train with tilt technology and a target maximum speed of 155 mph on existing track. The picture below, from the March 1985 ScotRail Staff Bulletin, shows a unique visit by APT to Glasgow SECC station.



Centre" — and the Argyle line can take main line locomotives and direct train loads of visitors to the SEC. APT pictured in 1985 at SECC station.

(from the 1985 ScotRail Staff Bulletin)

Following cancellation of the APT project by the Thatcher government, BR focused on developing 140 mph trains, with the IC225 East Coast trains ordered for the East Coast Main Line (ECML) electrification, with coaches built to a narrow profile allowing tilt technology to be added, though this was never done. ECML electrification in 1992 cut the best journey Edinburgh-London journey to 4 hours. SAPT Chairman John McCormick wrote to Dr. John Prideaux, then M.D. of BR InterCity, suggesting that journey times should be further cut by raising the top speed of trains to their design speed of 140 mph. However, this met with a stern rebuke accusing SAPT of belittling the achievements already made!

But Anglo-Scottish journeys were still uncompetitive with air, with rail's market share plunging to less than 20%. British Rail and politicians believed that rail speeds higher than 125 mph were not needed in the UK. After the opening of the Channel Tunnel in 1994, Eurostar trains crawled through the lines south of London at half speed. But the need for a high speed Channel Tunnel Rail Link (CTRL) was eventually realised, and the CTRL was authorised by the Westminster Parliament in 1996 and opened in 2007 to the impressively modernised St.Pancras station.

Scottish interest was sparked by the SAPT "FastTrack" conference in December 2005 organised jointly with the (now defunct) Railway Forum (see conference flyer on next page). The conference was attended by 118 delegates. Principal speakers included Chris Green, Jim Steer (of Steer Davies Gleave and Greengauge), Richard Brown (CEO of Eurostar), and John McCormick of SAPT. The conference was chaired by Tom Hart of SAPT.

Following the conference, SAPT organised a "HS2S" (High Speed to Scotland) pressure group jointly with the Scottish Chambers of Commerce. Many business and local authority interests supported this initiative, including Scottish Chambers of Commerce, SPT and SESTRAN, Edinburgh and Glasgow City Councils, Scottish Financial Enterprise, and the SCDI. Meetings were held alternately in Edinburgh and Glasgow throughout 2008.

Network Rail, recognising that rapid growth on the West Coast Main Line would exhaust capacity by 2025, published a "New Lines" report in 2008, calling for a North/South High Speed Line. Secretary of State for Transport Lord Adonis enthusiastically backed the need for a new HS2 north/south line.



The Railway Forum

Fast Track: High speed rail for Scotland

A seminar to make the case for a UK high speed railway

9 DECEMBER 2005 THE TEACHER BUILDING GLASGOW G1 4DB

"High speed rail is one of the big transport ideas for the 21" Cen-tury. It has already demonstrated that it can bring significant bene-fits in countries where major net-works have been established. Now generally, and Scotland in particu-lar, can benefit."

S fc **Transport** are pleased to sponsor a ground-breaking seminar to discuss the contribution that high speed rail can make to sustaining economic growth and improving social inclusion across the UK and specifically in Scotland.

The Railway Forum and the Scottish Association for Public

Labour's 2005 General Election manifesto contained a commitment to reconsider the case for a North-South high speed link. In addition Sir Rod Eddington, formely CE British Airways, has been asked by HM Treasury, in conjunction with Department for Transport, to identify Britain's transport infrastructure needs post-2015. Early indications are that high speed rail will be a major issue for consideration.

This is therefore just the right time to bring together the key individuals in the debate to look at how high speed rail could contribute to improving Scotland's transport links.

A wide ranging panel of expert speakers includes:

ar, can benefit."		
Adrian Lyons, Director General, The	Richard Brown	Chief Executive Officer, Eurostar
Railway Forum Sponsors include:	Chris Green	Chairman of the Railway Forum, non-executive Director Network Rail and ex-General Manager BR ScotRail 1984- 1986
itrathclyde Passenger Fransport Authority (SPTA) Scottish Enterprise	Jim Steer	Senior Partner at Steer Davies Gleave and formerly Director, Strategic Planning at the SRA
	Alistair Watson	Chair, Strathclyde Passenger Transport Authority
Scottish Association or Public Transport	If you would like to participate in this ex seminar please complete the attached pr <u>ATTENDANCE IS FREE HOWEVER SPAC</u> ONLY AVAILABLE ON A FIRST COME, F To find out more about The Railway For tion for Public Transport visit us on the The Railway Forum: www.railwayforum.c Scottish Association for Public Transport	roforma. E IS LIMITED AND PLACES ARE IRST SERVED BASIS. Drum and The Scottish Associa- web: om

Flyer for FastTrack conference in Glasgow in 2005, organised by SAPT and the Railway Forum.

An HS2 company was formed to evaluate the business case and optimum route for HS2. However, the phased construction timetable from London to Birmingham (2025), and Manchester and Leeds (2033), raised concerns as Scotland was not included.

The Scottish Government now enthusiastically supports the need for HS2 to extend to Glasgow and Edinburgh. A "Fast Track Scotland" report, issued by Scottish Transport Minister Keith Brown in December 2011, makes the case for High Speed Rail to Scotland.

Agreement has now been reached with the DfT for HS2 Ltd to undertake a study of route options from the north of England to Edinburgh and Glasgow. The HS2 project has cross-party support both in Westminster and Holyrood Parliaments.

However, a number of issues need to be resolved. Station capacity in Edinburgh and Glasgow needs to be provided, for trains up to 400 metres long. In Glasgow, Central station could be extended out towards the former Bridge Street site. An alternative site at High Street has also been proposed.

In Edinburgh, the Haymarket area may be the best site, as rail access to Waverley is congested.

Funding for the cross-border section of line between Manchester and Scotland is another issue.

Environmental problems of the new line in the Lake District and Borders will also have to be solved.



West Coast option for "HS2-S" proposed by SAPT



HS1 at Ebbsfleet, with a Eurostar train passing at high speed. HS2 is being designed for higher 400 km/h speed.

15

SAPT Office-bearers

and AGM Speakers 1962-2012

Presi	dents	Chairs		
Lord Mathers 1962-1967 Sir James Farquharson 1967-1977 Prof Arnold Hendry 1977-2003 Prof Chris Harvie 2003- Treasurers		Canon A O Barkway1962 - 1972Tom Hart1972 - 1976Prof Arnold Hendry1976 - 1977Dr. Morris Bradley1977 - 1985John Pinkerton1985 - 1988Dr. John McCormick1988 -		
R Ireland 1962-1967 Helen Broadbent 1967-1968 John Ferris 1968-1972 David Brown 1972-2005 John Ferris 2005-2011 Jordan Halliday 2011-		AGM Speakers 1982 Malcolm Rifkind, MP for Edinburgh Pentlands 1983 J Welsby, BR Director, Provincial Services 1984 B Cox, Scottish Transport Group 1985 Chris Green, General Manager, ScotRail		
Secre	etaries	1986 Keith Moody, SPT 1987 Councillor R.Mennie, Dundee Council		
Tom Hart1962-1968Dr. Terry Gourvish1969-1971Dr. Malcolm Reed1972-1974Frank Neville1974-1982Mike Foreman1982-1998Alastair Reid1998-Scott Simpson (membership)2002-SAPT Office Bearers 2012PresidentProf Chris HarvieChairDr. John McCormickVice PresidentTom HartLawrence Marshall		 G. Fraser, Tayside Region 1988 Councillor Turpie, Trond Haugen (Fife Council) 1989 Simon Fraser, ECML Manager Stephen Joseph, Transport2000 1990 Steven Lockley, DG of SPT 1991 S Boyle, PEIDA 1992 Cyril Bleasdale, Director, ScotRail 1993 Vernon Murphy, MD, Scottish Airports 1994 Paul Prescott, Scottish Director, Railtrack 1995 J Moffat, MD of Fife Scottish Buses 1996 Colin Paterson, MD of CalMac 1997 Councillor D Begg, Edinburgh City Council 1998 Alastair McPherson, MD, ScotRail 		
Vice Chair Secretary Members Secy Treasurer Commit Fife:	Ralph Barker Alastair Reid Scott Simpson Jordan Halliday tee Laurie Naumann	 2000 Sarah Boyack MSP, Minister for Transport 2001 Light Rail Conference (various speakers) 2002 Integrated Transport Conference 2003 Professor Chris Harvie 2004 Councillor A Watson, Chair, SPT 2005 Gordon Dewar, Commercial Director, ScotRail 2006 Tom Wileman, MD, Stagecoach Bus, Scotland 		
Highlands: Lothian:	John Logie Rolf Schmidt Graham Atkins Arthur Homan-Elsy	 2007 David Anderson, Transport Scotland 2008 Stewart Stevenson MSP, Transport Minister 2009 F von Meissner, RingZud Mike Connelly, tie 		
Strathclyde: David Brown Dr. Ann Glen General: Edith Hamilton Calum McCallum Paul Tetlaw		2010 Bill Reeve, Transport Scotland 2011 Nigel Wunsch, Network Rail 2012 Professor Iain Docherty, Glasgow University		

16 The last 50 years – and the next?

The 50 years covered by this SAPT history has seen an upsurge in car ownership and air travel, while local bus use has collapsed by a factor of four. Despite the rail closures of the 1960s and 1970s, rail use remained relatively constant until 2000, but has grown sharply over the last decade.

The figures below, from the Scottish Government's National Transport Statistics, show journeys in millions by air, local bus and train for journeys originating in Scotland.

Year	1960	1970	1980	1990	2000	2010	
Plane	1	3	6	10	17	21	
Bus	1664	1057	763	585	458	438	
Train	65	71	61	53	65	85	
Scottis	h Public	Transpo	ort Journ	eys by n	node (mi	illion)	

Car statistics are not available in comparable format, but since 1980 vehicle kilometres show rapid growth until around 2004. Since then, traffic has stabilised and has now begun to fall.

Year	Vehicle km (million)
1980	10,262
1990	17,476
2000	20,566
2005	22,060
2010	21,998
Car traffic on i	najor Scottish roads

Comparing today's train services with the timetable for 1962 shows a big increase in frequency:

	1962	2012	
Edinburgh-Falkirk-Glasgow	28	62	
Aberdeen-Edinburgh	7	18	
Inverness-Perth	5	12	
Glasgow-London	7	15	
Trains per day on four principal rail routes			

Future transport modal shift will be strongly influenced by fuel prices and road congestion. Global demand for oil, and dwindling reserves, will accelerate the current resurgence of rail travel.

Transport policy should lead the way to a sustainable future for travel in Scotland. Plans for major new roads should be scrapped. Rail electrification needs to be expanded beyond the EGIP programme to reach Aberdeen, Inverness and Dumfries. Reversing the steep decline in local bus use will depend on the Scottish Government setting up the co-ordinated transport framework which SAPT advocates. Trams and trolleybuses have a role in creating healthy, fume-free urban environments. The worsening economics of long distance road haulage, as oil prices increase, will boost rail freight. **SAPT is campaigning for:**

- An integrated public transport network of co-ordinated rail, bus and ferry services
- Electrification of trunk railways and development of metro and tram systems in major cities
- Smartcard and e-ticketing giving affordable, seamless travel by all public transport modes
- Building the HS2 High Speed railway from Scotland to London and Europe, reducing domestic flights
- Developing a Transport and Tourism strategy to boost tourism on Scotland's scenic railways
- Switching capital spending from roads to rail, busway, tram, metro and Park+Ride infrastructure

Will the next 50 years see as great a change in transport as the last 50 years? If you would like to help us shape the future of Scottish transport, why not join SAPT by returning the enclosed form, or contact:

The Scottish Association for Public	ort 11 Queens	Crescent, Glas	sgow G4 9BL	
Email: sapt@btinternet.com	Web:	www.sapt.org.uk	Phone:	07760 381729